SYLVIA A. QUAST Regional Counsel

EDGAR P. CORAL
Assistant Regional Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Region IX
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 972-3898

** FILED **

22MAR2017 - 11:25AM

U.S.EPA - Region 09

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION IX

In the matter of:	Docket No. FIFRA-09-2017-00 <u>O</u> 2
J.R. Simplot Company,	CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER
Respondent.)	pursuant to 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b), 22.18(b)(2), and 22.18(b)(3)

I. CONSENT AGREEMENT

The United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), Region IX, and J.R. Simplot Company ("Respondent") agree to settle this matter and consent to the entry of this Consent Agreement and Final Order ("CAFO"). This CAFO simultaneously initiates and concludes this proceeding in accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b) and 22.18(b).

A. AUTHORITY AND PARTIES

- 1. This is a civil administrative action brought pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act ("FIFRA"), 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(1), for the assessment of a civil administrative penalty against Respondent for violations of Sections 12(a)(1)(E) and 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136j(a)(1)(E) and 136j(a)(2)(S).
- 2. Complainant is the Director of the Enforcement Division, EPA Region IX, who has been duly delegated to commence and settle an enforcement action in this matter.
- 3. Respondent is J.R. Simplot Company, a Nevada corporation with headquarters offices located at 999 W. Main Street in Boise, Idaho, 83702-9009.

B. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS

- 4. Under Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(s), the term "person" means "any individual, partnership, association, corporation, or any organized group of persons whether incorporated or not."
- 5. Under Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §136(u), the term "pesticide" is, among other things, any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.
- 6. Under Section 2(q)(1)(D) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(D), a pesticide is "misbranded" if its label does not bear the registration number assigned under Section 136(e) of FIFRA to each establishment in which it was produced.
- 7. Under Section 2(q)(2)(C)(iii) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(2)(C)(iii), a pesticide is "misbranded" if there is not affixed to its container, and to the outside container or wrapper of the retail package, if there be one, through which the required information on the immediate container cannot be clearly read, a label bearing the net weight or measure of the content.
- 8. Under Section 2(p)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(p)(1), the term "label" means the written, printed, or graphic matter on, or attached to, the pesticide or device or any of its containers or wrappers.
- 9. Under Section 2(p)(2)(A) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(p)(2)(A), the term "labeling" means all labels and all other written, printed or graphic matter accompanying the pesticide or device at any time.
- 10. Under Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), the term "to distribute or sell" means to distribute, sell, offer for sale, hold for distribution, hold for sale, hold for shipment, ship, deliver for shipment, release for shipment, or receive and (having so received) deliver or offer to deliver.
- 11. Under Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), it is unlawful for any person in any state to distribute or sell to any person any pesticide that is adulterated or misbranded.

28

1

2

- 12. Under Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), it is unlawful for any person to violate any regulation issued under Sections 3(a) or 19 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136a(a) and 136q.
- 13. Pursuant to FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136-136y, the EPA Administrator promulgated regulations governing the labeling requirements for pesticides and devices, which are codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 156.
- 14. Pursuant to Sections 3, 8, 19 and 25 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. §§ 136a, 136f, 136q and 136w, the EPA Administrator promulgated regulations pertaining to standards for pesticide containers and pesticide containment structures ("the Container/Containment regulations"), which are codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 165 and 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.140-156.159.
- 15. "Agricultural pesticide" means any pesticide product labeled for use in or on a farm, forest, nursery, or greenhouse. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 16. "Appurtenance" means any equipment or device which is used for the purpose of transferring a pesticide from a stationary pesticide container or to any refillable container, including but not limited to, hoses, fittings, plumbing, valves, gauges, pumps and metering devices. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 17. "Containment pad" means any structure that is designed and constructed to intercept and contain pesticides, rinsates, and equipment wash water at a pesticide dispensing area. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 18. "Containment structure" means either a secondary containment unit or a containment pad. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 19. "Establishment" means any site where a pesticidal product, active ingredient, or device is produced, regardless of whether such site is independently owned or operated, and regardless of whether such site is domestic and producing a pesticidal product for export only, or whether the site is foreign and producing any pesticidal product for import into the United States. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 20. "Facility" means all buildings, equipment, structures, and other stationary items which are located on a single site or on contiguous or adjacent sites and which are owned or

operated by the same person (or by any person who controls, who is controlled by, or who is under common control with such person). 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.

- 21. "Operator" means any person in control of, or having responsibility for, the daily operation of a facility at which a containment structure is located. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 22. "Owner" means any person who owns a facility at which a containment structure is required. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 23. "Pesticide dispensing area" means an area in which pesticide is transferred out of or into a container. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 24. "Produce" means to manufacture, prepare, propagate, compound, or process any pesticide, including any pesticide produced pursuant to Section 5 of the Act, and any active ingredient or device, or to package, repackage, label, relabel, or otherwise change the container of any pesticide or device. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 25. "Producer" means any person, as defined by the Act, who produces any pesticide, active ingredient, or device (including packaging, repackaging, labeling, and relabeling). 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 26. "Refilling establishment" means an establishment where the activity of repackaging pesticide product into refillable containers occurs. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 27. "Refillable container" means a container that is intended to be filled with pesticide more than once for sale or distribution. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 28. "Refiller" means a person who engages in the activity of repackaging pesticide product into refillable containers. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 29. "Repackage" means, for the purposes of this part, to transfer a pesticide formulation from one container to another without a change in the composition of the formulation, the labeling content, or the product's EPA registration number, for sale or distribution. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 30. "Stationary pesticide container" means a refillable container that is fixed at a single facility or establishment or, if not fixed, remains at the facility or establishment for at least 30 consecutive days, and that holds pesticide during the entire time. 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.

C. ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

- 31. Respondent is a "person" as that term is defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), and as such is subject to FIFRA and the regulations promulgated thereunder.
- 32. Respondent is an "owner" and "operator" of five "facilities" that are each "establishments," as those terms are defined by 40 C.F.R. § 165.3, located at: (1) 25730 Avenue 96 in Terra Bella, California (the "Terra Bella Establishment"); (2) 4863 Carpenter Road in Stockton, California (the "Stockton Establishment"); (3) 21817 Fresno Coalinga Road in Five Points, California (the "Five Points Establishment"); (4) 2947 Highway 20 in Colusa, California (the "Colusa Establishment"); and (5) 36148 S. Burke Drive in Traver, California (the "Traver Establishment").
- 33. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent was a "refiller" that "repackaged" and dispensed the following "agricultural pesticides" at the following "refilling establishments" whose principal business is retail sale, as those terms are defined by 40 C.F.R. § 165.3:
 - a. PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil (EPA Reg. No. 7001-7777) and PHT Supreme Spray Oil (EPA Reg. No. 7001-7778), two pesticides for which Respondent is the registrant, at the Terra Bella, Stockton, and Five Points Establishments;
 - b. Roundup PowerMax (EPA Reg. No. 524-549) at the Stockton, Colusa, and Traver Establishments;
 - c. Touchdown HiTech (EPA Reg. No. 100-1182) and Roundup WeatherMax (EPA Reg. No. 524-537) at the Traver Establishment; and
- d. Gramoxone SL 2.0 (EPA Reg. No. 100-1431) at the Colusa Establishment. As such, these establishments and the agricultural pesticides they repackaged are subject to the Container/Containment regulations.
- 34. At all times relevant to this CAFO, Respondent repackaged the agricultural pesticide, Telone II (EPA Reg. No. 62719-32), at the Traver Establishment in order to apply the pesticide for compensation. As such, this establishment and the agricultural pesticide it repackaged are subject to the Container/Containment regulations.

- 35. Owners or operators of refilling establishments who repackage agricultural pesticides and whose principal business is retail sale and that have a stationary pesticide container or a pesticide dispensing (including container refilling) area must comply with the secondary containment requirements of the Container/Containment regulations. 40 C.F.R. § 165.80(b)(1).
- 36. At all times relevant to this CAFO, the Terra Bella, Stockton, Five Points, Colusa, and Traver Establishments included areas where agricultural pesticides were dispensed from a transport vehicle for the purposes of filling a refillable container. Each of these areas was both a "pesticide dispensing area" and a "containment pad," as those terms are defined by 40 C.F.R. § 165.3.
- 37. The containment pads in the pesticide dispensing areas at the Terra Bella, Stockton, Five Points, Colusa, and Traver Establishments were constructed on or before November 16, 2006 and are each "existing containment structures," as that term is defined by 40 C.F.R. § 165.83(b).
- 38. Inspections were conducted by a California Department of Pesticide Regulation ("CDPR") inspector: (1) on or about January 19, 2016, at the Terra Bella Establishment; (2) on or about January 8, 2015, at the Stockton Establishment; (3) on or about February 3, 2015, at the Five Points Establishment; and (4) on or about November 19, 2015, at the Colusa Establishment. In addition, an inspection was conducted by an EPA Region IX inspector on or about March 24, 2015, at the Traver Establishment.

TERRA BELLA ESTABLISHMENT

COUNTS 1 and 2: Distribution or Sale of Misbranded Pesticides

39. When pesticide products are stored in bulk containers, whether mobile or stationary, which remain in the custody of the user, a copy of the label or labeling, including all appropriate directions for use, must be securely attached to the container in the immediate vicinity of the discharge control valve. 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B). Every pesticide product shall bear a label containing, inter alia, the net contents as prescribed in paragraph (d) of this section. 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(a)(1)(iii). If the pesticide is a liquid, the net content statement shall be in terms

of liquid measure at 68° F (20° C) and shall be expressed in conventional American units of fluid ounces, pints, quarts, and gallons. 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(d)(2).

- 40. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent "distributed or sold" the pesticide, PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 15 and the pesticide, PHT Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 25 at the Terra Bella Establishment, as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), by holding the pesticides for distribution, sale, or shipment.
- 41. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent failed to have a label attached to Tanks 15 and 25 at the Terra Bella Establishment that marked or identified the net contents in terms of liquid measure, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(iii), and 156.10(d)(2).
- 42. Respondent's failure to mark or identify the net contents in terms of liquid measure on the labels attached to Tanks 15 and 25 at the Terra Bella Establishment, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(iii), and 156.10(d)(2), constitutes "misbranding," as that term is defined by Section 2(q)(2)(C)(iii) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(2)(C)(iii).
- 43. Consequently, on or about January 19, 2016, Respondent's distributions or sales of the pesticide, PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 15 and the pesticide, PHT Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 25 at the Terra Bella Establishment constitute two violations of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), which prohibits a person from distributing or selling a misbranded pesticide.

COUNTS 3 and 4: <u>Failure to Properly Identify the Container Type By Including the Required</u> <u>Statements</u>

44. For products other than plant-incorporated protectants, either a "nonrefillable container" or a "refillable container" statement, as applicable, must be placed on the label or container. 40 C.F.R. § 156.140. For "refillable containers," one of the following statements is required [except for inapplicable exemptions]: (1) "Refillable Container. Refill this container with pesticide only. Do not reuse this container for any other purpose," or (2) "Refillable Container" Refill this container with [common chemical name] only. Do not reuse this container for any other purpose." 40 C.F.R. § 156.140(b).

- 45. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent stated that PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil and PHT Supreme Spray Oil, both pesticide products other than a plant-incorporated protectant, were each packaged and distributed in refillable containers meant for refillable reuse. Neither of the two "refillable container" statement options required pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 156.140(b) was placed on the separate refillable containers or their labels for these two pesticide products.
- 46. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent failed to identify the container type by placing a "refillable container" statement on refillable containers containing either PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil or PHT Supreme Spray Oil, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 156.140(b).
- 47. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to identify the container type by placing a "refillable container" statement on refillable containers containing either PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil or PHT Supreme Spray Oil, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 156.140(b).

COUNTS 5 and 6: <u>Failure to Properly Label the Pesticide With Appropriate Residue Removal</u> Instructions

- 48. The label of each pesticide product packaged in a refillable container must include the residue removal instructions in this section. Instructions must be given for all pesticide products that are distributed or sold in refillable containers, including those that do not require dilution prior to application. 40 C.F.R. § 156.156.
- 49. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent stated that PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil and PHT Supreme Spray Oil, both pesticide products, were each packaged and distributed in refillable containers meant for refillable reuse. The residue removal instructions required pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 156.156 were missing from the labels of each of these two pesticide products.
- 50. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent failed to include residue removal instructions on the labels of refillable containers containing either PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil or PHT Supreme Spray Oil, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 156.156.
- 51. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to include residue removal instructions on the labels of

refillable containers containing either PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil or PHT Supreme Spray Oil, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 156.156.

COUNTS 7 and 8: Failure to Anchor or Elevate Stationary Containers of Liquid Pesticides

- 52. One of the specific design requirements for existing secondary containment units is that the owner or operator must either anchor or elevate each stationary container of liquid pesticide protected by an existing secondary containment unit to prevent flotation in the event that the secondary containment unit fills with liquid. 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).
- 53. On or about January 19, 2016, Tanks 15 (containing PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil) and 25 (containing PHT Supreme Spray Oil) were in an existing secondary containment unit but were neither anchored nor elevated.
- 54. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent failed to either anchor or elevate Tanks 15 and 25, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).
- 55. On or about January 19, 2016, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to either anchor or elevate Tanks 15 and 25, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).

STOCKTON ESTABLISHMENT

COUNTS 9 and 10: Distribution and Sale of a Misbranded Pesticide

- 56. On or about January 8, 2015, Respondent "distributed or sold" the pesticide, PHT Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 5 and the pesticide, PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 7 at the Stockton Establishment, as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), by holding the pesticides for distribution, sale, or shipment.
- 57. On or about January 8, 2015, Respondent failed to have a label attached to Tanks 5 and 7 at the Stockton Establishment that marked or identified the net contents in terms of liquid measure, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(iii), and 156.10(d)(2).
- 58. Respondent's failure to mark or identify the net contents in terms of liquid measure on the labels attached to Tanks 5 and 7 at the Stockton Establishment, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(iii), and 156.10(d)(2), constitutes "misbranding," as that term is defined by Section 2(q)(2)(C)(iii) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(2)(C)(iii).

59. Consequently, on or about January 8, 2015, Respondent's distributions or sales of the pesticide, PHT Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 5 and the pesticide, PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil, in Tank 7 at the Stockton Establishment constitute two violations of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), which prohibits a person from distributing or selling a misbranded pesticide.

COUNT 11: Distribution and Sale of a Misbranded Pesticide

- 60. When pesticide products are stored in bulk containers, whether mobile or stationary, which remain in the custody of the user, a copy of the label or labeling, including all appropriate directions for use, must be securely attached to the container in the immediate vicinity of the discharge control valve. 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B). Every pesticide product shall bear a label containing, inter alia, the producing establishment number as prescribed in paragraph (f) of this section. 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(a)(1)(v). The producing establishment registration number preceded by the phrase "EPA Est.", of the final establishment at which the product was produced may appear in any suitable location on the label or immediate container. 40 C.F.R. § 156.10(f).
- 61. On or about January 8, 2015, Respondent "distributed or sold" the pesticide, Roundup PowerMax, in Tank 11 at the Stockton Establishment, as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), by holding the pesticide for distribution, sale, or shipment.
- 62. On or about January 8, 2015, Respondent failed to have a label attached to Tank 11 at the Stockton Establishment that marked or identified the EPA producing establishment registration number of the final establishment at which the bulk product, Roundup PowerMax, was produced, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(v), and 156.10(f).
- 63. Respondent's failure to mark or identify the EPA producing establishment registration number of the final establishment at which the bulk product, Roundup PowerMax, was produced on the label attached to Tank 11 at the Stockton Establishment, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(v), and 156.10(f), constitutes "misbranding," as that term is defined by Section 2(q)(1)(D) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(1)(D).

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

64. Consequently, on or about January 8, 2015, Respondent's distribution or sale of the pesticide, Roundup PowerMax, in Tank 11 at the Stockton Establishment constitutes a violation of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), which prohibits a person from distributing or selling a misbranded pesticide.

COUNTS 12 to 15: Failure to Anchor or Elevate Stationary Containers of Liquid Pesticides

- 65. On or about January 8, 2015, Tanks 4 and 5 (containing PHT Supreme Spray Oil) and Tanks 7 and 8 (containing PHT 415 Supreme Spray Oil) were in an existing secondary containment unit but were neither anchored nor elevated.
- 66. On or about January 8, 2015, Respondent failed to either anchor or elevate Tanks 4, 5, 7, and 8, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).
- 67. On or about January 8, 2015, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to either anchor or elevate Tanks 4, 5, 7, and 8, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).

FIVE POINTS ESTABLISHMENT

COUNT 16: Failure to Keep Containment Structure Liquid Tight

- 68. One of the material specifications for all existing containment structures (including containment pads) is that the structures must be liquid-tight with cracks, seams and joints appropriately sealed. 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(a)(1).
- 69. On or about February 3, 2015, the containment pad (i.e., containment structure) located in the loading area at the Five Points Establishment had unsealed cracks.
- 70. On or about February 3, 2015, Respondent failed to keep all existing containment structures at the Five Points Establishment liquid-tight with cracks, seams and joints appropriately sealed, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(a)(1).
- 71. On or about February 3, 2015, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to keep all existing containment structures at the Five Points Establishment liquid-tight with cracks, seams and joints appropriately sealed, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(a)(1).

COUNTS 17 and 18: Failure to Anchor or Elevate Stationary Containers of Liquid Pesticides

- 72. On or about February 3, 2015, the two white "poly" tanks containing PHT Supreme Spray Oil were in an existing secondary containment unit but were neither anchored nor elevated.
- 73. On or about February 3, 2015, Respondent failed to either anchor or elevate the above-mentioned two tanks, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).
- 74. On or about February 3, 2015, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to either anchor or elevate the above-mentioned two tanks, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).

COLUSA ESTABLISHMENT

COUNT 19: Failure to Meet Capacity Requirements for Existing Containment Pads

- 75. Existing containment pads in pesticide dispensing areas must meet the capacity requirements set forth at 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(c). In particular, existing containment pads in pesticide dispensing areas which have a pesticide container or pesticide-holding equipment with a volume of 750 gallons or greater must have a holding capacity of at least 750 gallons. 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(c)(2).
- 76. On or about November 19, 2015, a CDPR inspector observed an existing containment pad located in the pesticide dispensing area at the Colusa Establishment that received pesticide-holding equipment (*i.e.*, pesticide-containing tanker trucks) with a volume of 750 gallons or greater. The containment pad had a holding capacity of approximately 380 gallons.
- 77. On or about November 19, 2015, Respondent's existing containment pad at the Colusa Establishment failed to have a holding capacity of at least 750 gallons, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(c)(2).
- 78. On or about November 19, 2015, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to have a holding capacity of at least 750 gallons for its existing containment pad at the Colusa Establishment, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(c)(2).

TRAVER ESTABLISHMENT

COUNT 20: Distribution and Sale of a Misbranded Pesticide

- 79. On or about March 24, 2015, Respondent "distributed or sold" the pesticide, Telone II, in the Telone II Tank at the Traver Establishment, as that term is defined by Section 2(gg) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(gg), by holding the pesticide for distribution, sale, or shipment.
- 80. On or about March 24, 2015, Respondent failed to have a label attached to the Telone II Tank at the Traver Establishment that marked or identified the net contents in terms of liquid measure, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(iii), and 156.10(d)(2).
- 81. Respondent's failure to mark or identify the net contents in terms of liquid measure on the label attached to the Telone II Tank at the Traver Establishment, as required by 40 C.F.R. §§ 156.10(a)(4)(ii)(B), 156.10(a)(1)(iii), and 156.10(d)(2), constitutes "misbranding," as that term is defined by Section 2(q)(2)(C)(iii) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(q)(2)(C)(iii).
- 82. Consequently, on or about March 24, 2015, Respondent's distribution or sale of the pesticide, Telone II, in the Telone II Tank at the Traver Establishment constitutes a violation of Section 12(a)(1)(E) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(1)(E), which prohibits a person from distributing or selling a misbranded pesticide.

COUNT 21: Failure to Keep Containment Structure Liquid Tight

- 83. On or about March 24, 2015, the containment pads (i.e., containment structures) located in the Refill Center and NW Tank Farm at the Traver Establishment had unsealed cracks.
- 84. On or about March 24, 2015, Respondent failed to keep all existing containment structures at the Traver Establishment liquid-tight with cracks, seams and joints appropriately sealed, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(a)(1).
- 85. On or about March 24, 2015, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to keep all existing containment structures at the Traver Establishment liquid-tight with cracks, seams and joints appropriately sealed, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(a)(1).

COUNTS 22 and 23: Failure to Anchor or Elevate Stationary Containers of Liquid Pesticides

- 86. On or about March 24, 2015, Tank 21 (containing Roundup PowerMax) and the Telone II Tank were in existing secondary containment units but were neither anchored nor elevated.
- 87. On or about March 24, 2015, Respondent failed to either anchor or elevate the above-mentioned two tanks, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).
- 88. On or about March 24, 2015, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(S) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(S), by failing to either anchor or elevate the above-mentioned two tanks, as required by 40 C.F.R. § 165.87(d).

D. RESPONDENT'S ADMISSIONS

89. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(b)(2) and for the purpose of this proceeding, Respondent: (i) admits that EPA has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this CAFO and over Respondent; (ii) neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations contained in Section I.C of this CAFO; (iii) consents to any and all conditions specified in this CAFO and to the assessment of the civil administrative penalty under Section I.E of this CAFO; (iv) waives any right to contest the allegations contained in this CAFO; and (v) waives the right to appeal the proposed Final Order contained in this CAFO.

E. CIVIL ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY

90. In final settlement of the violations of FIFRA specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO, Respondent shall pay a civil administrative penalty of NINETY-EIGHT THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED, AND SIXTY DOLLARS (\$98,960). Respondent shall pay this civil penalty no later than thirty (30) calendar days from the effective date of this CAFO. The civil penalty shall be paid by remitting a certified or cashier's check, including the name and docket number of this case, for the amount, payable to "Treasurer, United States of America," (or be paid by one of the other methods listed below) and sent as follows:

Regular Mail:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center

	PO Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000
2	
3	
4	Vosts City vittle the full amilia at the full amili
5	Federal Reserve Bank of New York ABA = 021030004
6	A a a a serie — (9010707
7	22 T.H Ct
8	Beneficiary = U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
9	Certified or Overnight Mail:
10	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1005 Convention Plaza
11	Mail Station SL-MO-C2-GL ATTN Box 979077
12	St. Louis, MO 63101
13	ACH (also known as Remittance Express or REX):
14	Automated Clearinghouse (ACH) payments to EPA can be made through the U.S. Treasury using the following information:
15	U.S. Treasury REX/Cashlink ACH Receiver
16	ABA = 051036706 Account = 31006, Environmental Protection Agency
17	CTX Format Transaction Code 22 – checking
18	Physical Location of U.S. Treasury facility: 5700 Rivertech Court
19	Riverdale, MD 20737
20	Remittance Express (REX) = $(866) 234-5681$
21	On Line Payment:
22	This payment option can be accessed from the information below:
23	www.pay.gov Enter "SFO 1.1" in the search field
24	Open form and complete required fields
25	If clarification regarding a particular method of payment remittance is needed, contact the EPA's Cincinnati Finance Center at (513) 487-2091.
26	100000, contact the Di ii s Chichinati Finance Center at (313) 48/-2091.
27	Concurrently, a copy of each check, or notification that the payment has been made by one of the
28	other methods listed above, including proof of the date payment was made, shall be sent with a

transmittal letter, indicating Respondent's name, the case title, and docket number, to the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk
Office of Regional Counsel (ORC-1)
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

Panah Stauffer SDWA/FIFRA Section Enforcement Division (ENF-3-3) U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105

Edgar P. Coral
Office of Regional Counsel (ORC-2)
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

- 91. Respondent shall not use payment of any penalty under this CAFO as a tax deduction from Respondent's federal, state, or local taxes, nor shall Respondent allow any other person to use such payment as a tax deduction.
- 92. If Respondent fails to pay the assessed civil administrative penalty of NINETY-EIGHT THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED, AND SIXTY DOLLARS (\$98,960) as identified in Paragraph 90 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph, then Respondent shall also pay a stipulated penalty to EPA upon EPA's written request. The amount of the stipulated penalty will be TWENTY-FOUR THOUSAND, SEVEN HUNDRED, AND FORTY DOLLARS (\$24,740) and will be immediately due and payable upon EPA's written request, together with the initially assessed civil administrative penalty of NINETY-EIGHT THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED, AND SIXTY DOLLARS (\$98,960), resulting in a total penalty due of ONE HUNDRED AND TWENTY-THREE THOUSAND AND SEVEN HUNDRED DOLLARS (\$123,700). Failure to pay the civil administrative penalty specified in Paragraph 90 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph may also lead to any or all of the following actions:
- (1) EPA may refer the debt to a credit reporting agency, a collection agency, or to the Department of Justice for filing of a collection action in the appropriate United

States District Court. 40 C.F.R. §§ 13.13, 13.14 and 13.33. The validity, amount, and appropriateness of the assessed penalty or of this CAFO is not subject to review in any such collection proceeding.

- (2) The U.S. Government may collect the debt by administrative offset (i.e., the withholding of money payable by the United States to, or held by the United States for, a person to satisfy the debt the person owes the U.S. Government), which includes, but is not limited to, referral to the Internal Revenue Service for offset against income tax refunds. 40 C.F.R. Part 13, Subparts C and H.
- (3) Pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 13.17, EPA may either: (i) suspend or revoke Respondent's licenses or other privileges, or (ii) suspend or disqualify Respondent from doing business with EPA or engaging in programs EPA sponsors or funds.
- (4) Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3701 et seq. and 40 C.F.R. Part 13, the U.S. Government may assess interest, administrative handling charges, and nonpayment penalties against the outstanding amount that Respondent owes to EPA for Respondent's failure to pay the civil administrative penalty specified in Paragraph 90 by the deadline specified in that Paragraph.
- (a) Interest. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717 and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(a)(1), any unpaid portion of the assessed penalty shall bear interest at the rate established according to 26 U.S.C. § 6621(a)(2) from the effective date of this CAFO, provided, however, that no interest shall be payable on any portion of the assessed penalty that is paid within thirty (30) days of the effective date of this CAFO.
- (b) Administrative Handling Charges. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(1) and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(b), Respondent shall pay a monthly handling charge, based on either actual or average cost incurred (including both direct and indirect costs), for every month in which any portion of the assessed penalty is more than thirty (30) days past due.
- (c) Nonpayment Penalties. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(2) and 40 C.F.R. § 13.11(c), a monthly penalty charge, not to exceed six percent (6%) annually, may be assessed on all debts more than ninety (90) days delinquent.

F. CERTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE

93. In executing this CAFO, Respondent certifies that the information it has supplied concerning this matter was at the time of submission, and is at the time of signature to this CAFO, truthful, accurate, and complete; and that Respondent has corrected the violations alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO. Under 18 U.S.C. § 1001, submitting false or misleading information can result in significant penalties, including the possibility of fines and imprisonment for knowing submission of such information.

G. RETENTION OF RIGHTS

- 94. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.18(c), this CAFO only resolves Respondent's liabilities for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO. Nothing in this CAFO is intended to or shall be construed to resolve: (i) any civil liability for violations of any provision of any federal, state, or local law, statute, regulation, rule, ordinance, or permit not specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO; or (ii) any criminal liability. EPA specifically reserves any and all authorities, rights, and remedies available to it (including, but not limited to, injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions) to address any violation of this CAFO or any violation not specifically alleged in Section I.C of this CAFO.
- 95. This CAFO does not exempt, relieve, modify, or affect in any way Respondent's duties to comply with all applicable federal, state, and local laws, regulations, rules, ordinances, and permits.

H. ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS

96. Each party shall bear its own attorneys' fees, costs, and disbursements incurred in this proceeding.

I. <u>EFFECTIVE DATE</u>

97. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.18(b)(3) and 22.31(b), this CAFO shall be effective on the date that the Final Order contained in this CAFO, having been approved and issued by either the Regional Judicial Officer or Regional Administrator, is filed.

28

J. BINDING EFFECT

- 98. The undersigned representative of Complainant and the undersigned representative of Respondent each certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this CAFO and to bind the party he or she represents to this CAFO.
- 99. The provisions of this CAFO shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent and its officers, directors, employees, agents, trustees, servants, authorized representatives, successors, and assigns.

FOR RESPONDENT J.R. SIMPLOT COMPANY:

12,140,20(7

DAVID SPURLING

Senior Vice President, Secretary, and General Counsel

J.R. Simplot Company

999 W. Main Street, Suite 1300

Boise, ID 83702-9009

FOR COMPLAINANT EPA:

3/21/17-DATE

KATHLEEN H. JOHNSON

Director

Enforcement Division

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX

EPA and J.R. Simplot Company having entered into the foregoing Consent Agreement, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that this CAFO (Docket No. FIFRA-09-2017 entered, and Respondent shall pay a civil administrative penalty in the amount of NINETY-EIGHT THOUSAND, NINE HUNDRED, AND SIXTY DOLLARS (\$98,960), and comply with the terms and conditions set forth in the Consent Agreement.

Regional Judicial Officer U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region IX

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that the original of the fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order, (**Docket No FIFRA-09-2017-0002**) was filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk, U.S. EPA, Region IX, 75 Hawthorne Street, San Francisco, CA 94105, and that a true and correct copy of the same was sent to the following parties:

A copy was mailed via CERTIFIED MAIL to:

David Spurling Senior Vice President, Secretary and General Counsel J.R. Simplot Company 999 W. Main Street, Suite 1300 Boise, ID 83702-9009

CERTIFIED MAIL NUMBER:

7016 1370 0000 2235 1138

An additional copy was hand-delivered to the following U.S. EPA case attorney:

Edgar Coral Assistant Regional Counsel (ORC-2) U.S. EPA, Region IX 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105

Regional Hearing Clerk

U.S. EPA, Region IX

Date